

Troutman Pepper Hamilton Sanders LLP  
875 Third Avenue  
New York, New York 10022

troutman.com



**Avi Schick**  
avi.schick@troutman.com

May 31, 2023

**VIA ECF**

Hon. Ramon E. Reyes, Jr.  
United States Courthouse  
225 Cadman Plaza East  
Brooklyn, New York 11201

**Re: *City of New York v. Old Dominion Tobacco Company, Inc* (Case No. 2:20-cv-05965)**

Dear Judge Reyes:

This firm represents defendant Atlantic Dominion. We write to follow up on our prior correspondence concerning Plaintiff's failure to fulfill its discovery obligations.

Counsel for New York City had advised that it was going to respond to Atlantic Dominion's letters about those failures, revise its privilege and redaction logs, and produce additional documents by April 26, 2023. Based on that representation, and with the understanding that reviewing the new material, and then meeting and conferring, would take at least a month, the Parties requested and were granted until May 31, 2023 to file their joint status report.

Unfortunately, the City has not yet responded to our letters and has not yet updated its privilege or redaction logs. And of the few files the City produced – eight files on May 10 – six were merely short (a minute or less) audio excerpts of far longer recorded interviews. The City has not turned over the full interview files and has not even identified the parties giving and taking the interviews. And despite repeated requests from Atlantic Dominion, the City has not advised when we will receive the response and logs promised to be delivered five weeks ago.

For these reasons, it is impossible for the Parties to prepare the joint status report due tomorrow. Atlantic Dominion therefore respectfully requests that the City be directed to fulfill its discovery obligations and that the joint status report be due thirty days after the City has done so.

Respectfully submitted,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Avi Schick".  
Avi Schick

cc: counsel of record